

APTLD Wellington: Minutes of Members' Meeting (draft)
Saturday 25 March 2006 / Wellington

Venue: Illot Theatre, Wellington Convention Centre, Wellington

Chair: Peter Dengate Thrush

Attended by: Representatives from members .au, .cn, .cx, .hk, .jp, .kr, .mn, .my, .nu, .nz, .sg, .tk, .tw, NeuStar and Afilias, observers CENTR, ICANN staff, sponsored guests from .ws, prospective members .ki, as well as representatives of numerous other ccTLDs attending ICANN

1. Opening

The Chair, Peter Dengate Thrush (.nz) opened the meeting at 8.47am with an introduction of APTLD Secretariat Jordan Carter and a welcome to new members and observers. He thanked InternetNZ for hosting the APTLD and ICANN meetings.

Peter Dengate Thrush listed the following Board Election results for adoption:

Chris Disspain (.au)	(for a two-year term until 2008 AGM)
Jonathan SHEA (.hk)	(for a two-year term until 2008 AGM)
Jaeyoun KIM (.kr)	(for a two-year term until 2008 AGM)
Shariya Haniz ZULKIFLI (.my)	(for a two-year term until 2008 AGM)

Chair/Chris Disspain (.au)

THAT the Board Election results be accepted.

Carried U

2. Update from the Board

Peter Dengate Thrush gave an update on behalf of the Board.

Three successful meetings were held in 2005, in Japan, Singapore and Jordan. He noted that the meeting in Jordan was excellent and was opened by the IT Minister and that Jordan would be suitable for another meeting.

There was discussion at the Singapore meeting about appointing a General Manager. In Jordan, a timeline was set in place. The Chair concluded the General Manager update by saying that interviews are being held at the moment and the new position will make a positive impact to APTLD.

As a result of some successful ccTLD Training School sessions, the Board has decided to permanently set up training courses that utilise the skill sets of the trainers available to APTLD. Details continue to be worked out.

3. Updates from APTLD Committees

Membership / Sponsorship Committee Report

Yumi Ohashi (.jp) spoke to the Membership and Sponsorship Committee Report. There has been outreach to some new ccTLDs but there unfortunately has not been any new membership since the September meeting in Jordan. The Cambodian ccTLD are waiting on government approval to join APTLD, their decision will be made soon. One representative from Mongolia (.mn) and two representatives from Samoa (.ws) have joined. Yumi noted that there are not many Associate Members. The activity of the Committee will change after the appointment of the General Manager, until then it will continue as normal. She briefly covered the plan for 2006, indicating that Western and Southern Asia will be target areas; also there will be work on the website to tailor it to membership.

Peter Dengate Thrush acknowledged the good work of the Membership and Sponsorship Committee by noting that it is one of APTLD's hardest working committees.

Thanks were given to .au and **COCCA**, who sponsored groups from Kiribati. It was noted that there is money available to bring other ccTLDs to APTLD meetings.

ICANN Relations Committee

Peter Dengate Thrush briefly reported on the ICANN Relations Committee. The main issue is the ccTLD contracts with ICANN. He noted that general relations with ICANN are on a good footing.

Constitutional Committee

Shariya Haniz Zulkifli (.my) spoke to the Constitutional Committee report. The report includes proposed constitution amendments and draft bylaws. She noted the amended pages start on page 6. She asked that changes be given a month prior notice and noted that there will be no formal vote at this meeting. Shariya gave this [presentation](#).

The Chair opened the floor to discussion on the amendments.

Proxies

Chris Disspain (.au) said that the proxies should be anyone you nominate as opposed to only someone from your own ccTLD.

David Farrar (.nz) saw the key part to be to allow people to cast their votes electronically. He noted that InternetNZ votes two weeks prior. This is a system that works.

Subscriptions

It was noted that associate members are a very different range of members. They often have different means in which they can contribute to APTLD. The Constitution Committee are considering scale fees to cater for this range.

AGM

Shariya Haniz Zulkifli (.my) noted that the AGM should be held in the first part of the year.

Chris Disspain (.au) responded that a work around would be to adjust the APTLD year as opposed to following a calendar year.

Peter Dengate Thrush (.nz) noted that APTLD can have the AGM online which would open the meeting to more those that could not attend.

Shariya noted amendments to [14.3](#) allows anyone to be an observer. She continued that the [14.8](#) amendment has enabled online elections, a very positive move for APTLD.

The chair asked members to consider these over the next month and give feedback to Shariya in the next month. Members will be asked to vote on this at the next meeting.

Meetings Committee

Chris Disspain (.au) briefed the members on the current status. Three meetings are being held a year. Venues have not yet been finalised for the coming year. Sri Lanka put in a proposal for the latter part of the year, October or November would suit them best. Also there is a possibility of holding the next meeting in Dubai; this would tie in well with the Morocco ICANN meeting.

Chris invited expressions of interest in hosting an APTLD meeting for the members.

The chair noted that the committee is attempting to spread the meetings over the region from the east to the west. However the greatest need is for countries to host in the middle of the region.

The chair suggested that the meetings should not tie with ICANN meetings as it is a significant commitment of time for those attending both. He opened the floor to comment on this. The

response was mixed, with the majority being in favour of holding the APTLD meetings to tie in with the ICANN meetings.

4. Minutes of the Jordan meeting

Chair/ Shariya Haniz Zulkifli (.my)

THAT the minutes of the Members Meeting held in Amman, Jordan on 2 and 3 October 2005, be received and adopted as amended as a true and correct record.

Carried U

5. Matters arising from the minutes

None.

6. Secretariat report

Jordan Carter (.nz) spoke briefly to the [report](#). He noted that much of the Secretariat's work has been in toward appointing the APTLD General Manager. This included screening CVs and making travel arrangement for interviewees. The Secretariat has also establish newsletters and worked on this.

Jordan then spoke to the [financial](#) section of the report. He noted that in order to save funds, APTLD audit will be done with InternetNZ's (APTLD Secretariat) audit. There are no surprises in the budget. Expenditure is below budget as meetings have been sponsored. However income is also below budget as membership fees for some members have not been paid. With both income and expenditure less than budgeted, the bottom line remains the same. He continued that the key decision is whether the membership fee should be removed.

On the matter of membership fees, the meeting referred to the [draft constitution](#) as presented by Shariya earlier.

Shariya Haniz Zulkifli (.my) noted that the Constitution is to be amended anyway. It comes down to what the organisation wants. Jordan noted that membership fees can only be changed by members, even with the proposed change. It was pointed out in discussion that in fact the Board can amend the fee schedule.

It was agreed by the meeting that the Board members are to decide on a new band system.

Chair/Chris Disspain (.au)

THAT the financial statements for the period to 25 March 2006 be adopted.

Carried U

The discussion turned to the appointment of the General Manager. The appointment will affect the Secretariat role and also the Meetings Committee and will be working with Yumi on the new website.

The Secretariat thanked InternetNZ for sponsoring the meeting.

Chair/Colin Jackson (.nz)

THAT the Secretariat's report be received, with thanks for the work done by the Secretariat.

Carried U

The Chair thanked Jordan Carter for his recent work, specifically with the appointment of the General Manager.

7. Strategic Plan

The Chair introduced the Strategic Plan. It is closely related to InternetNZ's plan. Budgeting for workshops has been put aside. Also \$15,000 has been allocated for the General Manager to do a technical outreach. There is no budget for interfacing with other bodies, this is as we have not yet spent anything here.

The Chair thanked .my for covering the legal costs of this.

It was noted that the new budget will be based on an increase of fees. The Secretariat noted that the actuals are not quite right. They should read \$57,500 (\$5,500 too low).

Chris Disspain (.au) asked what the carried surplus is.

The Secretariat answered \$129,174.

Chris Disspain noted that the General Manager will be funded from this surplus.

Stafford Guest (.nu) noted that he would like to see the training underway as soon as possible and for it to be included in the 2006 budget.

Chair/ Shariya Haniz Zulkifli (.my)

THAT the business plan and budget be adopted.

Carried U

8. General Manager Employment Update

The decision to employ a General Manager was made in Amman. The committee involved in the process are Yumi Ohashi (.jp), Peter Dengate Thrush (.nz), Jordan Carter (.nz) and Shariya Haniz Zulkifli (.my). The Committee is interviewing candidates this week.

There was an excellent response with 194 applicants from Malaysia alone. The shortlist was brought down to 20 candidates, from there each of the committee prepared a list ranking the candidates. The group came together and brought the shortlist down to five. Bringing the candidates to NZ was the most cost effective option.

The five candidates come from the following countries: New Zealand; Japan; Malaysia (2) and Australia.

The committee is looking for someone with experience in Executive Director roles in organisations similar to APTD rather than with a background in the Internet.

The meeting broke from 10.20 – 11.00am

Chris Disspain (.au)/ Chair

THAT APTLD will hold a further two meetings this year in venues to be agreed, but the current intention is that they are to be held in Dubai and Sri Lanka.

Carried U

9. Members Sharing

China

Professor Qian (.cn) gave this [presentation](#).

Professor Chan concluded the presentation by saying that the reason for the uptake .cn names is that people think that they are a Chinese company. Also because the price is comparable to the .com price and it is easy to register to .cn (no currency change needed).

The share registry system costs less than 7USD.

Shariya Haniz Zulkifli (.my) asked what percentage of non registrants are not Chinese. There are less than 5%.

The Chair thanked Professor Chan.

10. Update on WSIS

Marcus Kumar, Working Group Secretariat of WSIS gave an update of WSIS noting that the process is a continuation and that the debate on Internet governance is just began. He said that WSIS had a very positive outcome as did Tunis. The Tunis meeting acknowledged the great work of the Internet community around the world, but also called for room for improvement.

Marcus said that the Internet Governance Forum should provide a platform for government and nongovernmental stakeholders to work from.

The open issue is what should be on the agenda. There are two different views. The Internet community and the western governments would like only a few issues to be discussed. While others would like a broad coverage, this could result in a similar meeting to WSIS.

The Internet community in the Asia Pacific area has a lot to contribute. The Pacific had very strong arguments on how Internet development can help them culturally and practically.

Marcus hoped that the future WSIS meetings could do some good for developing countries and include them in Internet governance.

Chris Disspain (.au) gave his take on the WSIS meeting. He said that it was a very interesting meeting. The attendees were asked for suggestions as to how the Government Forum should be structured. He felt that the meeting was difficult for those accustomed to an open dynamic environment. He noted that every government represented was in favour of a multi stake holder approach. Chris felt that ccTLDs need to be seriously involved in the process in order to work together on issues such as spam etc, issues may not be addressed otherwise. Spam, cybercrime, access issues, multilingualism and capacity building are on the agenda.

Marcus highlighted the importance that the ccTLDs remain engaged with their governments at a national level.

What can APTLD members do individually to help was asked.

Chris Disspain answered that they should be liaising in their own national area. He also felt that APTLD as a body – should keep an eye on what is happening.

Will the Internet community be outnumbered was then asked.

Chris answered that it is a possibility as it is a government forum, he then reiterated the need to have an APTLD presence.

The key message to the meeting was that the governments will be attending to learn more about the industry. They will each have a mission associated with their own country. There needs to be a close relationship between ccTLDs and their governments.

11. APTLD Training

The Chair introduced the item. He informed the group that Thailand have made an offer to support the training, now content is all that is required. The floor was opened to discussion by asking what the syllabus should be and what do members need.

The group answered with the following:

- Should not be solely a technical training course, but more focused on policy.
- Policy frameworks and how to deal with your government etc.

The chair called for a volunteer to lead the group. Suggesting Jonathan Shea (.hk) should do so. This suggestion was agreed by the Members.

12. Members Sharing Continued

Tokelau

Youst ? (.tk) gave this [presentation](#).

After the presentation Youst noted that there are 1.6 million domain names registered (not 1.3 million as presentation says). He also added that there is a filter that controls content that may be culturally insensitive to Tokelau.

No questions.

Korea

Jaeyoun Kim (.kr) gave this [presentation](#).

No questions.

Australia

Chris Disspain (.au) briefly updated the group on .au. He described their work to be domain monetisation. He said that as of today .au is starting major education campaign as people do not know who we are or what we do. When asked why this is needed, Chris responded that they solve complaints; people need to know who to come to. Also they need to establish that they are indorsed by the government in their policy making.

Hong Kong

Jonathan Shea gave this [presentation](#) on (.hk).

The chair asked why there is such a low rate of domain names considering your population and economy.

Jonathan answered that most people have picked up on the .com domain name.

The meeting broke for lunch from 1.00 – 2.15pm

13. CENTR Update

Fay Howard, CENTR General Manager gave this [presentation](#).

14. IANA Update

Kim Davies gave this [presentation](#) on IANA.

The floor was opened to questions.

David Farrar (.nz) noted the ccNSO's IANA working group involvement with IANA and that there has been some improvement in IANA's performance since this. The Working Group is an alternate avenue to reaching IANA if required. He noted that most outstanding issues are historic not current

What has driven down the response times of IANA?

This is due to staffing increases and more prioritisation, now have a better idea of how things work.

Kim noted that there is a very strong three way relationship better IANA, ICANN and the DoC. IANA staff are involved with the DoC several hours every day and they are privy to what we do and are acutely aware of the concerns of the community. ICANN is also aware of the importance of the IANA's role.

There was a discussion on how the community can apply pressure to USG DoC to improve their performance. Kim pointed out that this is completely over IANA's head.

Paul then noted that in effect Verisign appear to be slower than DoC in implementing changes in response to IANA's requests. Kim answered that hopefully in a month or two we can have straight through processing.

Paul asked further questions regarding the new IANA website and some of the content on it. Kim answered that IANA wants to make everything we do as easy as possible. It is important to make policies and procedures as straight forward as possible. This is a draft document, nothing

has changed – it is merely to remove all the lawyer language. Kim noted that the test website is more about structure than anything at this stage.

David Farrar asked whether there is any prospect of IANA being able to directly update the root zone, as outlined in the draft Verisign agreement. Kim believes the provision is in the contract. The system will be able to generate a zone file if the need arises - but this has not yet been discussed.

How do you think this document will be finalised?

Kim – we have actually replaced this with something better.

Please highlight some of the stages you will be going through.

Kim – We have some software that needs to work in the current scenario. Our focus initially is having a system that does what we need it to do today. We are doing our best to get this software developed.

Bart Mackay (Verisign) noted that historically, IANA has been the cause of delay in root zone changes. The changes now take around seven days. It is not the case that normal cases take several weeks. Three organisations in seven days is not a bad speed and nobody is a hold up in this process.

Kim agreed that there is no view that Verisign is a general problem. The community should let IANA know if there are things IANA does that cause unnecessary delays.

Bart rejoined that Verisign are rather meticulous in time-stamping requests, and could provide implementation timeline statistics.

Elaine (COCCA) asked after the digital security key use in dealing with IANA.

Kim answered that it is just an extra security step to improve the integrity of user authentication he also noted that it is under evaluation.

15. Members Sharing continued

Mongolia

Bassansuren Burma (.mn) gave this [presentation](#).

The meeting broke from 3.25 – 4.05pm

Kiribati

? (.ki) spoke on Kiribati, starting with geographical facts on the country then moving into the history of the ccTLD. It is their intention to remain inline with the policies of IANA and ICANN and expressed interest in joining APTLD.

The next focus for .ki is to increase the number of domain names. Money raised from the domain names will be invested in the country's telephony.

Internet speed is an issue, they are only now getting wireless, which should be running by the middle of the year. This will improve speeds.

? thanked auDA and COCCA for sponsoring their travel to APTLD meeting.

New Zealand

Debbie Monahan gave this [presentation](#) on .nz.

She then opened the floor to questions.

Why was there a preference for the Nominet model?

Debbie answered that they prefer to resolve a dispute at that stage as they have full control of the process while also being informal. She noted that InternetNZ does not have any involvement in the mediation; this is outsourced to lawyers and retired judges etc. She noted that it is totally hands off, .nz solely provides administration.

Samoa

Laeimau Oketeri Tanuvasa (.ws) began her presentation by explaining that Samoa used to be called Western Samoa and were given the ws country code. They have since dropped the 'Western' as this refers to being westernised. Unfortunately they still have the 'w' in their country code. She then gave this [presentation](#).

Laeimau then spoke of the digital divide between the Islands and the more developed countries. She thanked ICANN for coming close to the Pacific Islands, making it possible to attend the ICANN and APTLD meetings.

16. Presentation on .Asia

Ching Chiao (.Asia) gave this [presentation](#).

17. InternetNZ and Pacific Outreach

Simon Riley (.nz) spoke on InternetNZ's relationship to the Pacific Islands. New Zealand has long had strong links to its neighbouring countries. He then gave this [presentation](#).

He reiterated that because the ICANN meeting is being held in New Zealanders, Pacific Islanders were able to attend. There are 80 delegates from 16 different Pacific Islands attending GAC, and Don Hollander is later holding a Pacifica day.

The Chair noted that APTLD is glad to see InternetNZ's involvement in this work and while APTLD would like to be involved in this area one day, at this stage being aware of what each is doing is enough for now. This will ensure there is no double up in work.

The Chair thanked the group for attending the meeting.

The meeting closed at 5pm.