APTLD members and supporters met in Caesar Park Hotel, Taipei on 27 and 28 November 2012. More than 80 representatives from 18 ccTLDs and 22 other organisations met to exchange ideas on issues related to governance, DNS related legal and policy issues, domain name abuse, APTLD membership and organisational updates.

Chair Jonathan Shea (.hk) opened the meeting on Day 1 at 9:10am. He thanked the local host Taiwan Network Information Center (TWNIC) and gave an overview of the two-day meeting.

Opening and Keynote Speeches

Shian-Shyong Tseng, Chairman of TWNIC, welcomed the attendees to the meeting and to Taiwan and shared with them the recent development of network security operations in Taiwan. Tien-Lai Teng, Director of the Department of Posts and Telecommunications at the Ministry of Transportation and Communications, talked about Taiwan’s Internet creativity and application developments. Chuan-Te Ho, Director of the Department of Information Management at the Research, Development and Evaluation Commission, Executive Yuan, updated members of the i-Taiwan project. Cliff Lai, Chairman of TWIA (Taiwan Internet Association) and Co-President of Taiwan Mobile, talked about the future of mobile Internet application developments in Taiwan.

Organisational update

APTLD General Manager Jian Zhang presented the activities and achievements of APTLD in the last year to members. Chris Disspain (.au) talked about the activities of ICANN and shared with members the current work and discussions at the ICANN Board, including the new gTLD process, WHOIS review, IANA Customer Services consultation, etc. Keith Davidson (.nz) shared with attendees the activities of the working groups under ccNSO and the SO’s recent development.

Parkpoom Tripatana (.th) discussed the impact by Thailand country wide flood to their operations. Ting Chen (.cn), Xiao Zhang (.asia), and Jonathan Shea (.hk) introduced their organisations and updated members of their recently developments. Debbie Monahan (.nz) presented their recent proposal and consultations on the opening up their second level .nz for registrations. YuKyung Jung (.kr) shared with members KISA’s research and work on OID (object identifier) and ORS (object resolution system). Ching Chiao (.asia) reported the work done by the IDN gTLD WG.

Legal, governance, and policy issues

H.J. Kown (.kr) presented remotely the related laws and ordinances and their implications to cloud computing in Korea. Hiro Hotta (.jp) shared with members the oversight and governance structure of JPRS in managing .jp. Edmon Chung (.asia) talked about possible mechanism in suspending abusive domain name registrations and invite APTLD members to work together on the policies. Michael Young (Architelos) presented remotely the domain name abuse statistics and trends. Gang Li (.cn) shared with members the anti-phishing effort from APAC.

Membership discussion
Jordan Carter presented his independent research report and the initial recommendations that follow. Jian Zhang (APTLD GM) reported on the Board’s advice and recommendations for members’ discussion.

Chris Disspain (.au) encouraged APTLD mapping its IDN ccTLD membership structure with the ccNSO proposal. He asked why the board had not been comfortable with Jordan’s recommendation on including gTLD as ordinary member. Jian Zhang answered for the Board that the Board felt that the survey results had shown members’ concern for that.

Jörg Schweiger (.de) asked if new gTLD could choose to pay whatever membership fee they want to. He also thought APTLD might need to address to the difference between new gTLD operators and contracted gTLD registry. Jian Zhang said the gTLD shall follow the associate membership fee structure and it would be self-selective from fee bands. Currently APTLD accepts both gTLD operators and contracted gTLD registry as associate members.

Kuo-Wei Wu (ICANN Board member) asked if APTLD had conducted any scenario analyses. He thought the Board should make clear the rationale for their recommendations.

Chris Disspain (.au) referred the meeting to survey questions 6 and 7 and asked what the analysis was on the replies to those questions. Jonathan Shea (APTLD Chair) said they had not simply counted the number as many of the replies had conditions attached to them. They found it difficult to decide if the replies are a clear “yes” or “no”.

Chris Disspain (.au) said there should be clearer picture on IDN ccTLD voting right at the AGM for introducing the IDN ccTLD membership. And the Board needs to have a better rationale to explain why they do not accept recommendation 2 by Jordan Carter. He also asked board members to give more explanation on their recommendations.

Kuo-Wei Wu thought if APTLD does not welcome new gTLD as members, they are going to create their own institution. Maybe they would have 200+ members and became much bigger than APTLD. The ccTLD community might lose the opportunity to communicate with the gTLD community.

Jonathan Shea (APTLD Chair) said the Board had been trying to come up with the best option for members to consider. The Board did go through some scenario analyses and took into account the worst case scenario.

Ching Chiao (.asia) said there were more than 100 new gTLD applicant observers in Registry Stakeholder Group (RySG) and most of them are members of the New TLD Applicant Group (NTAG). The NTAG was a very active and very vocal group following a bottom-up process. Moreover, new sub-groups had been forming, e.g. geo-names, community gTLD, sub-groups. He was glad that RySG can house them rather than pushing them away. Maybe APTLD could also actively reach out to the applicants from AP region.

Sebastien Ducos (ARI) remarked in his personal capacity that gTLD applicants are all on a level playing field, and they are targeting to be sustainable businesses; nevertheless, they are not necessarily all for-profit. He asked if APTLD had given any consideration to geo-gTLD that operates very similarly to ccTLD. Jian Zhang said no at this stage. Sebastien asked if there would be enough time for review after one year. Jonathan Shea (APTLD Chair) said they were only trying to be more cautious. The review can happen before or later than one year.

Jian Zhang (APTLD GM) said CENTR (regional ccTLDs organization in Europe) only welcomes gTLD from Europe as their associate members; they need to have no conflict with the ccTLD and only up to two gTLDs could be approved to join the membership in one single General Assembly (GA).
Chris Disspain (.au) referred to ccNSO and basically agreed that IDN ccTLDs are actually ccTLDs and that probably also applies to APTLD. But for new gTLD, the issue is very different. He agreed with Hiro Hotta’s view on going back to the first principle. APTLD might need to take the time (12—18 months) to review what APTLD wants to be. Some might think that after IDN, there is nothing for APTLD to accomplish, and APTLD will gradually lose its relevance.

June Seo (.cc & .tv) agreed with Hiro Hotta and Chris Disspain. The Board is not saying “no” to gTLD now; it is just that they could not simply say yes or no now. That is the reason for the Board’s recommendation. They need to buy time to discuss and review. Jonathan Shea echoed with June in that the second recommendation is not a final decision. Nobody could tell for sure what will happen in 12 months’ time.

Jörg Schweiger (.de) said abiding by the principle of freedom of the Internet and in his personal view, one should welcome the opening up of membership to new gTLDs. But he recalled during a ccNSO meeting in Seoul, where ccTLD attending agreed that there would be competition from new gTLDs. Hence APTLD should also consider this for its decision.

Kuo-Wei Wu said the discussion so far only focused on “membership” issue. Maybe a schematic study would help. Schema 1: APTLD to include new gTLD as members; schema 2: two structures (cc and g) under the APTLD umbrella; schema 3: APTLD and another gTLD organisation outside. Maybe APTLD could start from such schematic review to decide and review the membership issue. Jonathan Shea (APTLD Chair) agreed that might be a good approach. Basically, APTLD has two objectives: 1. sharing of information, 2. acting as a voice for members. They would analyse the scenarios based on those objectives.

Edmon Chung (.mo) said as a ccTLD operator, they shared the concern of having gTLD as ordinary members. A lot of things will happen in two years’ time, so the Board needs to consider carefully. He agreed that it is very hard for the board to make a decision at the moment. He suggested APTLD taking the leadership to create another organisation for the AP region’s gTLD. The two organisations could combine at a later stage. He said DotAsia would be happy to help with that working together with the GM.

Choon Sai Lim (.sg) said some ccTLDs might not really worry about competition between gTLD and ccTLD. But reading from the survey, he could see there were concerns as well. He agreed that APTLD needs to be cautious and review the situation. He thought gTLDs are always free to create their own organisation anyway.

Jonathan Shea (APTLD Chair) agreed with Edmon’s suggestion. The suggested setting up of the new organisation could go in parallel with the second recommendation. He remarked that it would be a reality that the difference between ccTLD and gTLD will go blur. Some organisations would end up operating both.

Debbie Monahan (.nz) agreed with .au that IDN ccTLD membership should follow the same structure as ccNSO. She said there’s not enough information at this stage to decide on new gTLDs. She welcomed Edmon’s idea. APTLD needs to be clearer on APTLD role and purpose.

Stephen Deerhake (.as) agreed on including IDN ccTLD as members following ccNSO’s structure.

Parkpoom Tripatana (.th) thought APTLD should be an organisation for ccTLDs. gTLDs should not be included. Suggestion of a new organisation is cleaner.
Ting Chen (.cn) said it had been difficult for the Board to make a decision at the time and they wanted to hear more from members. She also asked to consider what APTLD could do for new gTLDs. She welcomed the ideas received during the session. She agreed with the recommendation on IDN ccTLD membership.

YungJin Suh (.kr) supports the recommendation on IDN ccTLD membership and agreed that APTLD needs to consider the voting right issue. As for the new gTLD membership issue, he thought APTLD needs to provide better service to its existing members first. Only when APTLD becomes a better organisation, gTLD will want to and request to join.

Ian Chiang (.tw) said TWNIC does not disagree with new gTLDs to be APTLD members, but need to be clear about APTLD role and values. Need to consider multiple operators/managers with multiple hats and how to accommodate this diversity.

Stafford Guest (.nu) supported Hiro Hotta’s position and the need of making clear APTLD’s objective before any move. He does not want to jeopardise the relationship between ICANN and APTLD due to any changes.

Jonathan Shea (.hk) supported embracing IDN ccTLDs and that APTLD should check on the alignment with ccNSO. In relation to new gTLDs, as a minimum, he welcomed them as associate members. He agreed that with APTLD resources, it might be a good idea to form a group/structure for new gTLDs in the AP region. In the meantime, APTLD needs to review its mission and objectives.

Jian Zhang thanked members’ inputs. She invited members to further consider the questions on the last slide. Jordan Carter thanked members for all the inputs as well.

Dinner

After Day 1 meeting, TWNIC hosted a dinner at Chingye-Shinleyuan, Huashan 1914 Creative Park. Attendees enjoyed the mouth-watering Taiwanese cuisine and had some fruitful and productive exchanges.

Recording of Thanks

APTLD thanks the local host Taiwan Network Information Center for the generous sponsorship and warm hospitality during the meeting.

All available presentations are on the APTLD web site: www.aptld.org.

The next APTLD Members’ Meeting will be held in Singapore in February 2013.

Jian Zhang
General Manager